SPCRD GLOBAL
PUBLISHING
Sustainable Solutions

RAMSS Review of Applied Management
and Social Sciences

Journal homepage: <http://ramss.spcrd.org>

ISSN (Print): 2708-2024

ISSN (Online): 2708-3640

What are the Crisis and Issues of Governance in Pakistan? An Analysis

Malik M. Hafeez^a, RaisNouman Ahmed^b, Muhammad Danyal Khan^c, Muhammad Asif Safdar^d

^aAdvocate & Corporate Consultant, Hafeez Law Associates, Pakistan

malikhafeezphd@gmail.com

^bAssistant Professor of Law, University Gillani Law College, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan.

rais.nouman@bzu.edu.pk

^cPhD Scholar, Brunel University, London, UK

muhammad.khan4@brunel.ac.uk

^dAssistant Professor of Law, University Gillani Law College, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan.

ARTICLE DETAILS	ABSTRACT
History: Accepted: 29 April 2020 Available Online: 15 June 2020	<p><i>Governance is quite distinguishable from the government that deals with executive, its mode of appointment or election, state institutions and their functioning powers that are documented in constitution and laws there under while governance deals with policy, decision-making and government's effectiveness. Government has constitutional and legal duties and limitations in dealing with civil society, media, press and private sector. Government owes responsibility of the development of undeveloped areas and facilitates the residents to have equal opportunity, rule of law, standardized education and health services, employment opportunities, maintain security, law and order of the country. Whereas, governance deals with principles of solutions to the problems of the public and private sector. Good governance ensures socio-economic stability, rule of law, meritocracy and welfare of citizens through social services and developments. Both government and governance work together to deal with political and administrative structures as well as establishment of cooperative network and connection between the different sectors of the state to resolve the shared public disorders, complications and problems however, good governance is the prerequisite for administrative, political, socio-economies solutions and human development. This paper will explore the elements of good governance and identify the issues of governance in Pakistan with conclusion of proposed solutions.</i></p>
Keywords: Governance; Good Governance; Socio-Economic Instability; Democracy; Kleptocracy	
JEL Classification: G34, O17, P16, P19	
DOI: 10.47067/ramss.v3i1.24	

© 2020 The authors. Published by SPCRD Global Publishing. This is an open access article under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author's email address: malikhafeezphd@gmail.com

1. Introduction

Governance is about to develop an appropriate structure and mechanism for directing and managing any state's or public sector institution or organization for effective and efficient operation of concerned institution to render quality services to all stakeholders. It has been explained that "good

governance in the public sector encourages better informed and longer-term decision making as well as the efficient use of resources. It strengthens accountability for the stewardship of those resources. Good governance is characterized by robust scrutiny, which places important pressures on improving public sector performance and tackling corruption. Good governance can improve organizational leadership, management, and oversight, resulting in more effective interventions and, ultimately, better outcomes. People's lives are thereby improved." Although the fundamental objectives of public sector are to enhance or maintain the well-being of citizens and satisfy a complex range of political, economic, social, and environmental objectives over the short, medium, and longer term but the mechanism to achieve the objectives are generally determined through a political process for which the legal, ethical, and other standards and norms, and the different types of intervention are required. Therefore, the government determines framework to have legislation or regulations for rendering social and security as well as control of assets or entities including state-owned entities. Good governance requires that government should play a role in promoting fairness, peace through maintenance of law and order, and sound international relations. Good governance improves organizational leadership, management and public sector performance efficiency to upgrade people's lives by curbing corruption with robust scrutiny.

2. Examination of the Available Literature

The academic question in relation to good governance mainly focuses on unequal progress in various countries with similar resources and identical political formations. Some states take precedence over other states with reference to their economic progress and social stability. The fundamental variable that creates this inequality lies in the standards of governance. The quantum of good governance relies on the efficient working of the states' organs North and (Thomas 1973). Although, the research rightly investigates the working of the states' organs, however it does not reflect upon non-state actors such as private markets working in the states. To fill the gap, an empirical academic investigation suggests that the good governance have some dependence on the issue of open market system in the states. Acemoglu and (Zilibotti 1997). The research also connects good governance with democratic performance by examining the interconnection of the both variables. However, the evidence suggests that only democratic working alone cannot guarantee good governance in India and it works efficient in China where democratic working is under numerous limitations. (Przeworski et al., 1995). To answer this limitation, the research suggests that the participatory democracy is a tool effective for good governance leading to economic growth and social stability. Rodrik (2000)

An academic research during year 2000 tried establishing the correlation between good governance and economic growth. However, the study faced theoretical limitations for establishing its real connection to democracies (Rodrik et al., 2004). In the same year some other researches also tried to establish the correlation between governance and economic progress. However, the critical examination of the studies reveals that the researches do not have applied perspective of contributing the issue. The theoretical approach towards establishing correlation did not find merits in academic debate. To have a pure economic analysis of good governance, the research methodology demands statistical analysis of the issue instead of studying the issue in descriptive manner. Ahmad is another researcher who have studied the significance of good governance to enhance the overall national development (Khan 2006). Later, the issue was analyzed with the perspective of political governance and its relationship with economic uplifting and suggests that the ad-hoc culture can largely impact the standards of good governance in the country (Kafeer, 2007). A research from Bangladesh perspective successfully establishes that the correlation between issues of governance and education sector are real and need solution (Al-Samarrai 2009).

In the view of governance issues of Pakistan, one may probe the correlation between political governance and economic growth. The correlation remained fragile throughout history. One of the researches finds that there exists a positive correlation between political governance and economic growth of Pakistan (Zia 2009). In a developing state like Pakistan, good governance through political control can impact the uplifting of both public and private sectors. It is an open secret that the good governance at public and private organizational structure can tangibly contribute to the economic well-being of a developing country (Acemoglu and Robinson 2013). Moreover, the research demonstrates that the correlation between economic success and good governance are connected to other variables such as social, political, cultural, and environmental factors. The research also finds that the positive correlation exists among governance and development goals of developing states. The research involved the relation of development with governance and rule of law in different countries of the world (Ken 2014). The research demonstrates that the Asian continent is largely affected by the less performing structure of good governance. The countries in Asia are producing to their maximum capacity; however the challenge to good governance is hindering the delivery of fruits of governance to common populations. The issue is serious in low-income states and the gross domestic progress is directly related to the governance levels in the country.

A research during year 2015 measures the correlation between human resource and economic progress in Pakistan during 40-year period. Moreover, the relationship between education and the economic progress is enormous. The educational uplifting can directly impact good governance that may result in uplifting economic growth.

The analysis of academic literature indicates that the available studies have mainly focused on economic perspective of good governance and overall growth of the low-income countries. Moreover, the studies seem to limit themselves on a focused area. The paper therefore expands its examination of good governance as an issue of legal concern. The paper argues that the good governance not only produces economic progress but also paves the way for rule of law.

3. Elements of Good Governance

Both internal and external nature of a community is required to for the prosperity and happiness of individuals' life and nation as a whole. An internal nature of a state consists of inhabitants and their virtuous life, conduct, health civilization, nourishment and wealth whereas the external factors require good order of persons, things and gracefulness of the country. Hans further explains that in good governance institutions are indispensable for social welfare, fear of God, peace, justice, education, health, economic activities, communal rules, institutionalizations, free trade, a monetary system, and a legal system. A well-functioning price-system, sound and stable monetary system, free entry and exit, freedom of private property and contract, liabilities rules and a stable economic policy are major elements of social infrastructure to promote good governance. Government in governance sense means sound traditions and institutions that exercised the authority to govern the country wherein a mechanism of selection of government, its monitoring and replacement should be transparent and vibrant. Capacity of government institutions to effectively formulate and execute sound its policies as well as respect of citizen, integrity and credibility of state institutions that govern economic and social interactions among them are fundamentals of good governance.

Violence resulted political instability or political terrorism, unconstitutional institutional conduct, regulatory burden because of incompetent peroneal, market unfriendly policies, ineffective judicial control, graft are considered indicators of bad governance. Similarly, failure to manifest separation between public and private activities, lack of predictable legal framework and government

behavior for application of law or equal protection of law, unnecessary formalities including rules and regulations for executive approvals, permissions and licensing to encourage rent-seeking rather community welfare, similarly, unfair priorities that are inconstant with development and resulting misallocation of resources, lastly, nontransparent decision making are key indicators of bad governance in any government. However, voice and accountability, government effectiveness and rule of law in any government guarantee good governance wherein accountability, participation in decision making, census orientation in decisions, protection of human rights, judicial independence and separation of power among state institutions, transparency in administrative actions, abuses of corruption with strong anti-corruption mechanism, freedom of information, administrative competence and administrative neutrality having merit based public services are fundamental apparatuses of good governance.

Good governance is more than citizens' right but it is a constitutional responsibility of government to ensure rule of law, independent administration of justice, meritocracy in civil services, equal opportunities for all in businesses, employment, public work and developments, transparency and fair accountability and protection of citizens' fundamental rights. Therefore, relationship between government and citizen is not only constitutional but also contractual instead of representative. Governance, in fact, is a mechanism to control the powers and ensure the smooth functioning of government's agencies wherein state functionary should discharge their duties accordingly for the betterment of state and society. Democracy is not governance but it is a tool to elect the rulers or ruling elites and make them accountable whereas governance means a good order having rule of law and effectiveness.

4. Governance's Issues in Pakistan

From the birth of Pakistan, ruling class is the name of an alliance between landlords and the burgeoning industrial class having support of state institutions including security institution and civil bureaucracy. The nature of the ruling elite depends upon economic growth process that brought affluence to the few at the expense of the many. However, gradual erosion of social infrastructure, pervasive poverty and growing social and economic inequality weakened the social values, faded the strength of civil society and resulted extremism to militarization. Secondly, Economic growth has been associated with poverty, and in some areas growing poverty whereas the literacy rate is lowest having poor standard of education. A major segment of the Pakistani society perceives that there is nothing in this growth process for them, therefore, this factor resulted resurgence of ethnic, religious and regional groups that are using the deprived section of society against government and state institutions with the backing of regional and international actors to achieve their own ulterior motives. This polarization is heightening the violence and disappointment for society when they were exploited by the miscreants on the basis of ethnic, religious and regional deprivation, backwardness, unemployment, bad governance, oppression of state functionaries and their corrupt practices, poverty and poor social services. The corrupt ruling elite take the benefit of said social disorder and violence to pressurize the state intuitions to give them indemnity against accountability process on the name of national interest to maintain the security, law and order.

Thirdly, the rapid urbanization rate is another issue of governance. The current trend of urbanization will enlarge the cities or municipalities areas more than two time over the last decade. Therefore, the cost of providing basic services in big cities, and the financial squeeze on government, a growing proportion of the urban population are causing hurdles to furnish minimum civic services. Even the percentage of urban population living in Guttersnipes (KatchiAbadis) is increasing day by day and situation of urban areas is alarming because of visible social stress and associated violence that is

causing difficulties the local and provincial governments to handle issues of urban localities. Therefore, the federal, provincial and local governments have no other option except to increase their budgetary grants to slow down the urbanization, enhance basic services and develop rural areas having easy access and connectivity with cities. These measure are necessary for sustainable development. Therefore, the governments should formulate polices for rural developments to provide basic facilities including uninterrupted supply of electricity, school education, availability of emergency services and medical doctors at basic health units, sanitations and water supplies, comfortable public transportation through infrastructure of roads having connectivity with markets wherein farmers may sell their produce. However, local police should behave professionally with the incumbents and not become an instruments of ruling elite and influential people to victimize the innocent residents on their behalf to threat and terrorize the innocent with police powers.

Another element of governance is bad economic situation of the country and crucial payment of external debts and their instalments, huge current and fiscal deficit, moneylending, illegal tax evasion. Last governments did hard work to take huge short-term and long-term external and internal debts with maximum interest rate to spend unnecessary development projects without setting the priorities. Education, health and basic serveries were not the priority of previous governments. They didn't focus to control alarming population growth, increase in imports and decrease in exports, low productivity and growth, to take measure to bring a boost in agriculture and services industry. Unfortunately, they willingly played with concocted number of growth through fudging to satisfy the international donor to take debt. When newly elected government came into power it was difficult for them to pay the debt without enough reserves therefore, they appealed to the governments of friendly countries including China, UAE and Saudi- Arabia for financial assistance to pay the debts and avoid bankruptcy. The moneylending and terror financing became a challenge for the government to satisfy the international community especially Financial Action Task Force (FATF) to oust the name of Pakistan from grey list but also avoid to be included in black list. The naming in black list can be disastrous for social, economic and security related issues of any country. The previous governments not only enhanced debt with high rate of interest but also with existing levels of indebtedness they increased government expenditure on unproductive purposes that resulted an intolerable debt-servicing burden on national exchequer. The head of last two governments and their cronies are corruption facing cases with the charges of money laundering and kick bags. In Pakistan, the situation today is not too good but the government economic team is struggling to bring economic stability but IMF program has placed a credit squeeze with lot of conditionality of structural reforms that may be necessary for sustainable economic growth or cause slump in the GNP growth rate.

More than sixty-five (65%) population resides in rural area but they are directly and indirectly connected with agriculture industry. The main exporting products were textile and agriculture related goods but in last decade, the agriculture related exports decreased because of government policies that were not only harming for agrarian but also government institutions failed to modernize the agriculture, provide productive seeds and quality pesticides, facilitate the farmers and establish markets to buy farmers' produces timely with reasonable price. The workers and farmers faced lot of difficulties to survive in agriculture industry. The government's policies including subsidizing sugar, industrial rebate on sales tax and lack of institutional checks and balances on markets, middle-men (brokers), fertilizer and pesticides traders and dealers discouraged the agrarians. Similarly, energy crises also disappointed the business community and suppressed the sustainable industrial growth that was imperative to enhance the exports and curtail current deficits.

Another issue is a rapid loss of the natural resources including depletion of forests, soil erosion

and salinity, rising toxicity levels of rivers, untreated disposal of effluents, and rising levels of air pollution are not only effecting climate to lead healthy life but also affecting the agriculture and health of the residents. Industrial waste and dirty water polluted the environment that produced diseases and unhealthy working environment for all section of working classes. Polluted environment not only caused poverty through infliction of diseases but also life hazardous for work's effectiveness. For instance, there is no regulatory mechanism to regulate the pumping of underground water for domestic, industrial and agricultural uses.

Lastly, state is an organized political community living under defined system of government. The defined territory, population, government and sovereignty are reckoned essential elements of a state. Government being an essential and significant component of a state connotes institutionalization of government organs such as legislature, executive and judicature rather power concertation or control of any individual or group of individuals. The concentration or dispersion of powers, responsibility and liability of use of power by any individual or group of individual helps to determine the nature and form of government. The nature of state may be federal, confederal or unitary likewise the nature of government may also be parliamentary, presidential or monarchical. Although Monarchical forms of government envisaged absolute powers including legislature, judicature and executive's powers in the hand of ruler without accountability of usage of said powers but parliamentary or presidential forms of government is a product of democracy that cannot work without responsibility and accountability. The constitution of a Pakistan indicates and determines the nature of state and government, mechanism of constitution of state organs, rights and duties of state and citizens towards each other, supremacy of constitution or any organ of government and custodian of constitutional power, rights and duties.

5. Conclusion

There is no doubt that crisis of good governance has badly affected the socio-economic and political progress of Pakistan. Weak governance resulted many social evils such as poverty, unemployment, illiteracy, terrorism, sectarianism, religious extremism, pollution, police oppression, institutional corruption, nepotism, lack of transparency, favoritism, bureaucratic incompetence and poor health facilities. Crisis of bad governance is also a reason of an economic instability that may not only affect national defense and internal security but also causing economic and social disorder in the society. Unfortunately, kleptocracy flourished in last decade instead of democracy in Pakistan wherein corrupt ruling elite corrupted the state institutions through key appointments of their cronies who worked for their masters rather in the interest of state and its institutions. It seems that an effective accountability process started in the country and corrupt elite is crying and alleging political victimizations with help of their allies controlling media and corporate market to send a message to civil society and international actor that there is a threat to the democracy. Political instability suits the corrupt elite to jam the accountability and blackmail the state institutions that accountability and economic growth can't work together. They are propagating that accountability is causing economic and political instability therefore, investors are not willing to invest in Pakistan resultantly, this process of accountability should be stopped.

However, new government seems to be determined for accountability of corrupts because of corruption and burden of foreign debts the sovereignty and security of the state are not only at stake but also corruption and governance crises have tarnished the image of Pakistan in the comity of nations. Although feudalism either it is industrial or rural is a big hurdle in the way to bring good governance and fair democratic process in the country. They have enough resources to reach the power corridors through elections and relationships with civil servants. Feudal mindset having significant role in policy and decision making would not allow any reforms for social welfare and good governance if

they allow than it will directly affect their interests. Therefore, in the presence of feudal mindset including industrial, religious and rural feudal in policy making there are little chances of any change in the governance. Feudalism in Pakistan is a worse form of imperialism that can't work with powers of state institution or without police powers.

Both feudalism and corruption are key causes behind the governance crises in Pakistan and clash of institutions. How it can be possible that corruption in the bureaucracy, inefficient administrative machinery, nepotism and discrimination would present good governance in Pakistan. Although independent judiciary exists in the country but mechanism of administration of justice is full of flaws and weaknesses for instance, outdated and old laws of colonial era, lack of modern tool of investigation and production of evidence before courts of law, lack of professional human resource and incapability of administrative authorities shifts the burden of administration of justice on judiciary that can't administer the justice within possible time and without reliable evidence. Therefore, weak judicial system and poor accountability mechanism also caused bad governance, economic and social disparity in the country. We can't ignore illiteracy and ignorance of masses, burden of economic and social terrorism, economic and political instability affect the foreign policy and governance mechanism of the state institutions that were working under the pressure of national and international actors. However, abolishing feudalism, promoting national integration and maintaining provincial harmony, ending clash of institutions, eradicating the culture of corruption, devolution of power at grass root level, formulation of long term policy for poverty eradication, education, police reforms and health facility along with offering equal opportunities of work, business and development for all segment of society can bring positive change, strengthen and ensure good governance in Pakistan wherein the constitution role of national media is very important to bring change and stability in the country.

References

- Keefer, P. (2007). Clientelism, credibility, and the policy choices of young democracies. *American journal of political science*, 51(4), 804-821.
- Khan, M. (2006). Governance, Economic Growth and Development since the 1960s: Background paper for World Economic and Social Survey 2006. New York, UNDESA.
- Przeworski, A., Limongi, F., & Giner, S. (1995). Political regimes and economic growth. In *Democracy and development* (pp. 3-27). Palgrave Macmillan, London.
- Siddiqui, D. A., & Ahmed, Q. M. (2009). The causal relationship between institutions and economic growth: An empirical investigation for Pakistan economy.
- Siddiqui, D. A., & Ahmed, Q. M. (2013). The effect of institutions on economic growth: A global analysis based on GMM dynamic panel estimation. *Structural Change and Economic Dynamics*, 24, 18-33.
- Haq, R., & Zia, U. (2009). Does governance contribute to pro-poor growth? Evidence from Pakistan (No. 2009: 52). Pakistan Institute of Development Economics.
- Al-Samarrai, S. (2009). The impact of governance on education inequality: Evidence from Bangladesh. *Public Administration and Development: The International Journal of Management Research and Practice*, 29(3), 167-179.
- Aron, J. (2000). Growth and institutions: a review of the evidence. *The World Bank Research Observer*, 15(1), 99-135.