



## Construction & Validation of Civic Sense Scale (CSS) in Urdu Language for Pakistani Secondary School Students

<sup>a</sup> Muhammad Qasim Razzaq, <sup>b</sup> Rifaqat Ali

<sup>a</sup> PhD Scholar, Department of Education, Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan

<sup>b</sup> Associate Professor, Department of Education, Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Bahawalnagar Campus, Bahawalnagar, Pakistan

### ARTICLE DETAILS

#### History:

Accepted 15 June 2023

Available Online June 2023

#### Keywords:

Civic Self-Perception, Civic Knowledge, Civic Practices, Civic Sense, Pakistan

#### JEL Classification:

D83

DOI: 10.47067/ramss.v6i2.342

### ABSTRACT

*Civic sense plays a crucial role in human life. It determines the success and usefulness of a citizen in a society. The civic sense consists of both civic knowledge and civic practices. The students' civic knowledge or self-perception of civic sense improves their civic practices in the community. This paper describes constructing and validating the Civic Sense Scale (CSS). This scale is prepared to measure students' civic knowledge and civic practices. Generalized Structural Component Analysis (GSCA) technique is applied in this study. This scale was administered to 1200 Federal Government Educational Institutions students studying in 10th grade in Pakistan. A total of 1196 students out of 1200 students responded to the questionnaire. The data was collected from students through a stratified sampling technique. Both self-perception and civic practices on civic sense consisted of 45 items. There were 23 and 22 items on Civic Sense Scale on self-perception and civic practices, respectively. The reliability indicator Cronbach's alpha and Rho were observed to be more than 0.7. Likewise, the construct validity, convergent and discriminant validity measures were in acceptable ranges. These show that Civic Sense Scale (CSS) is highly recommended to measure civic sense and its practices in the educational setting. Initially, this study was limited to secondary school students in Federal Government Educational Institutions of Pakistan.*

© 2023 The authors. Published by SPCRD Global Publishing. This is an open-access article under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author's email address: rafaquatiub@yahoo.com

### 1. Introduction

Self-perception or knowledge of civic behaviours is integral to any civic activity or practice. The students' self-perception, regarded as the personal knowledge gained through different sources, results in the practical implementation of that knowledge as their personal involvement in civic practice. Therefore, individuals' self-perception or personal knowledge, especially students, significantly impacts their civic practices, and students adopt and exhibit appropriate roles and

responsibilities in any society.

## **2. Literature Review**

Humans cannot live in isolation and without society. Social isolation hampers positive affective outcomes such as happiness, fulfilment, and companionship. Social isolation decreases the ability to cope with anxiety, fear, and passiveness and withdraw in challenging times. Therefore, social isolation has a tremendous and significant socio-economic, socio-political, and socio-psychological impact on human beings (Banerjee & Rai, 2020). However, education inculcates in citizens knowledge, rights, and responsibilities toward their community. It prepares citizens, in general, well-equipped to live in harmony with the social order and social norms of any society (Marsoni, 2016). In this way, the prime aim of education in any community is to enhance members' knowledge and skills to boost society's development and welfare (Bhardwaj, 2016).

Not necessarily; civic education is related to democracy in society. However, it extends to teaching skills, transferring information, and values and behaviours required for active functioning in society (Villegas-Reimers, 1994). It is worrisome that only a minimum or significantly less percentage of populations have been found to have even a minimum level of civic consciousness. It can be, indeed, that education does not contribute substantially to civic consciousness in populations (Villegas-Reimers, 1994). The curriculum is limited to only providing knowledge about particular topics related to civic rather than developing students' civic skills, behaviours, and attitudes (Villegas-Reimers, 1994). Although, Civic education has personal legal, moral, and social aspects. Most of the time, civic teaching involves teaching content and transferring information about constitutional, political, and economic aspects of the Constitution (Wahlström, 2022).

Although each subject taught to students has its importance and usefulness for the individual and society, the need and urgency of civic education subject are undeniable at all stages of child education due to its contribution to equipping citizens with an awareness of their rights and duties in a democratic, welfare and nonviolent society (Dewantara *et al.*, 2019). Thus the knowledge of norms and beliefs needed by members of the society for the functioning of welfare and a democratic, peaceful community is called civic awareness or civic knowledge (Abbasi, 2017). Therefore, societies consciously make arrangements for awareness of civic rights and duties to new generations and young ones to strengthen the bond of the new generation and young ones with the democratic and social structure and values of society (Habibyar, 2009). So that the democratic, ideological, and civic system remains intact.

Civic education deals with theories, principles, and knowledge of citizenship. Civic education aims to make citizens aware of their rights and responsibilities to function as good citizens (Dewantara *et al.*, 2019). For these reasons, civic education as a subject is included as a compulsory subject at different levels of education all over the world (Dewantara *et al.*, 2019) to produce awareness among individuals and train democratic values in their personalities so that they can use their potential as an active social member of the society for welfare and peacefulness of society (Mihai, 2014).

Despite the importance and significant attention on the civic development of their citizens by all societies, civic awareness, and practices have become a global issue (Epstein, 2017). Nations across the globe have placed particular emphasis on civic education. Teaching civic education aims to inculcate civic awareness and foster patriotism, unity, patience, tolerance, volunteerism, mutual

respect, and the rule of law (Ismail *et al.*, 2019). On the contrary, neglect and not focusing explicitly on civic education has appeared as a decline in social and civic structure, failure to volunteer to abide, and lack of intrinsic obedience to discharge duties (Lenzi *et al.*, 2014). One such case study is Zambia. After realising the decline and deterioration in civic and civil structure, the Zambian government has included civic education as a core subject (Muleya, 2019).

Civic education teaching is expected to enhance students' commitment, dedication, and interest in social problems and societal issues. The awareness of rights, struggle for rights, and discharge of responsibilities and duties is possible through the teaching of the subject of civic education (Lukman & Audu, 2014). Furthermore, by teaching civic education, social integration and social cohesiveness among students of different ethnic and racial backgrounds can be achieved (Claes *et al.*, 2009). Furthermore, civic education can resolve global terrorism, violence, racial and ethnic prejudice, and discrimination (Dharma *et al.*, 2018).

The civic education curriculum comprises civic knowledge or awareness, skills, and disposition. These core elements of civic education prepare students to face societal challenges in the best possible way (Barone, 2002). In this way, responsible citizens are produced (Lukman & Audu, 2014), and students become capable of acting as active citizens (Gopinathan, 2012). Therefore, societies formally make arrangements in schools to make their future equipped with civic skills and attitudes (Zaff *et al.*, 2008). In this way, when students are made aware of civic knowledge, the probability of following and abiding by civic practices increases (Lin, 2014) because knowledge increase is proportional to civic practices (Lin, 2014). Thus, civic knowledge and practices increase an individual's social and civic role (Yusuf *et al.*, 2021).

### **3. Measurement of Civic Sense and Civic Engagement**

The measurement of civic sense remains a challenge for researchers due to its link to politics, democracy, philosophy, and morality. In this regard, different attempts are worth mentioning. Researchers included diverse constructs and factors in their instruments to measure civic sense. Chi *et al.* (2006) identified personal responsibility behaviours (moral and conventional), civic responsibility (concern for others, the value of group work, caring for the community, appreciating diversity, and environmental stewardship), leadership efficacy, civic thinking skills, civic participation skills (perspective taking skills, communication skills, group membership skills, and conflict resolution skills), schools as a community, and civic knowledge. Hatcher (2011) identified the most common components of civic assessment of civic knowledge and engagement as civic identity, civic skills, and civic knowledge.

Doolittle and Faul (2013) conducted a study to develop and validate the civic engagement scale. The study sample was American university students of social work and education majors with an average of 28 years. This self-reported scale consisted of two aspects civic attitude and civic behaviour; civic attitude encompasses beliefs and feelings to be active and benefiting individuals of the society, and civic behaviour comprises actions towards the community. The eight attitude items had an alpha score of 0.91, and the 06-behaviour scale scored an alpha score of 0.85 in the final version of the instrument. This scale was made for college and university students.

Belay and Tefera (2022) validated civic engagement measures in adolescents with an average age of 17 in the Ethiopian context. This scale also comprised community involvement services and informal helping behaviour. The instrument consisted of 15 items. The subscale and overall civic

engagement scale were highly reliable.

White (2012) labelled civic engagement under the umbrella term of a child's civic identity outcomes. These outcomes comprised 02 aspects; the child's civic values and social responsibility. The child's civic values result in acceptable reliability ( $\alpha = 0.80$ ). Whereas child's social responsibility, this scale has two factors; responsibility towards people and responsibility to the community. Both sub-measures have adequate reliability. The social responsibility aspect of responsibility to the community has an alpha value of 0.89). In contrast, the responsibility to people aspect has an alpha value of 0.72.

Veeh *et al.* (2019) conducted a study to develop a civic engagement measure for first-year American university students. The civic engagement instrument covered two aspects; civic-mindedness and civic-oriented activities. Civic-mindedness includes the individual perceived ability to perform different civic activities. At the same time, the civic-oriented activities involved informing about the frequency of civic activities conducted over a period.

#### **4. Statement of the Problem**

Civic education and civic sense are not given due space in the school curriculum worldwide. More focus remained on reading, writing, and arithmetic, even though civic education was integral to the education system in the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries. The scholarly disciplines failed to focus on civic education (Keith *et al.*, 2013). Apart from focusing on civic education in schools, the way civic education is done at schools is also an obstacle to effective and active civic education in educational institutions (Keith *et al.*, 2013).

Civic education in schools is limited to only paving the way for support from students for the current regime and inculcating minimum civic literacy in place, making students active citizens engaged in civic activities (Dudley & Gitelson, 2003). Because of the curriculum and topics involved in civic education, most students in Latin America consider civic education irrelevant to their daily lives and feel civic sense as an abstract subject rather than a concrete and practised nature (Villegas-Reimers, 1994). It is equally essential to transform individuals' cognitive, affective, cultural, psychological conceptual, and rational dimensions of civic self and civic life to transform individuals into active, capable civic individuals (Henderson, 2003).

In any educational activity, the measurement and assessment of students' acquired learning outcomes become critical to determine the successfulness of that educational activity. For these reasons, the current study measured students' understanding of self-perception on civic sense and civic practices in the academic environment. This study introduces a multidimensional assessment tool. The researchers labelled this as Civic Sense Scale (CSS). This scale can enable educators to access or evaluate students' civic knowledge and practices.

#### **5.. Objectives of the study**

The current study has the following objectives:

- i. To develop and validate a self-perception scale on civic sense for secondary school students in Pakistan.
- ii. To develop and validate civic practice scale for secondary school students in Pakistan.

## **6. Research Method**

### **6.1 Population and Sample**

The study population was 12018 students in 191 Federal Government Educational Institutions across Pakistan. The researchers used a stratified sampling technique and selected 1200 students from Federal Government Educational Institutions (Cantt/ Garrison).

### **6.2 Initial Tool Development**

Initially, 80 items were developed to measure two aspects of civic sense: self-perception and civic practices for CSS tool development. Both elements of the civic sense or CSS tool consisted of four dimensions: personal responsibility, moral responsibility, social responsibility, and legal responsibility, and each dimension contained ten items. The items for these dimensions were adapted from different studies which measured civic sense and duties. The items were structured and included in a scale based on recommendations and findings of the studies mentioned above.

The first version of the CSS tool questionnaire comprised two parts. The first part of the questionnaire consisted of 40 statements measuring students' self-perception in a civic sense. The second part of the questionnaire contained 40 items related measure students' civic practices. The preliminary CSS questionnaire was translated into Urdu for students to understand easily. Educational experts and language experts assisted in translating initial questionnaire items into Urdu. A pilot study was conducted before the final trial of preliminary CSS-Urdu to ensure the relevance and suitability of items in CSS-Urdu.

As a result of pilot testing, the researchers changed or removed ambiguous and complex terms reported as confusing for the students. As a result of an analysis of pilot testing data, 35 items whose Cronbach Alpha values were less than 0.7 were removed from the final instrument of CSS-Urdu. Finally, 45 items were selected to measure the suitability of the measurement model. The 23 items were selected to measure students' self-perception of civic sense, and 22 items were chosen to identify students' civic practices' four dimensions in CSS-Urdu.

### **6.3 CSS-Urdu Validation Analysis**

The Generalized Structural Component Analysis (GSCA) technique is considered more efficient and suitable for validating the reliability and validity of items in a measurement model (Cho & Choi, 2020). Therefore, the researcher used the GSCA structural equation modelling approach to validate the measurement model in the confirmatory factor analysis approach. In this regard, the GSCA Pro software available was used to confirm the hypothesised underlying measurement model in the CSS-Urdu instrument. The items having significance loading at 95 % confidence intervals were included in the tool (Das, 2019).

## **7. Results**

### **7.1 Model Fit**

Table 1 depicts the GSCA model fit indices of FIT and AFIT values of 0.511 and 0.51, respectively. It means that items and latent variables included in the CSS-Urdu explain the 51% variance in the model (Hwang, 2009). The 0.526 value of FITm affirms that this model explains the 52.6 % variation in items of the measurement model (Hwang *et al.*, 2017). Additionally, the goodness of fit index (GFI) value of 0.98 and standardised root mean square residual (SRMR) value of 0.047 confirm the acceptable fit (Hwang & Takane, 2014) for this measurement model.

Table No. 1				
Model Fit Indices				
FIT	AFIT	FITm	GFI	SRMR
0.511	0.51	0.526	0.98	0.047

## 7.2 Reliability and Validity

Civic Sense Scale (CSS) has two components; the Self-perception or knowledge component of civic sense and the civic practices component of civic sense. Both components have four further dimensions each. Self-perception or knowledge component has dimensions of Self-perception of Personal Responsibilities (SPPR), Self-perception of Moral Responsibilities (SPMR), Self-perception of Social Responsibilities (SPSR), and Self-perception of Legal Responsibilities (SPLR). On the same structure, the civic practices aligned with the civic perception or knowledge component of CSS-Urdu have four civic practices dimensions; Civic practices on Personal Responsibilities (CPPR), Civic practices on Moral Responsibilities (CPMR), Civic practices on Social Responsibilities (CPSR), and Civic practices on Legal Responsibilities (CPLR).

Hair Jr *et al.* (2021) recommended that if the reliability indices of Alpha and Rho values are 0.70, then the item and construct validity and reliability are acceptable. Likewise, they suggested that the latent variable or construct should have the Proportion of Variance explained (PVE) above 0.50 to consider the latent variables' convergent validity adequate. Table 2 shows the values of various items and latent variable quality measure indices. The measurement model's latent variables have PVE above 0.50 for all latent variables, alpha fallibility index, and Rho reliability index values above 0.70. it means the items and related construct or latent variable in CSS-Urdu have acceptable validity and reliability indices.

Table 2 Construct Quality Measures								
Measure	SPPR	SPMR	SPSR	SPLR	CPPR	CPMR	CPSR	CPLR
PVE	0.51	0.53	0.517	0.563	0.524	0.5060	0.527	0.548
Alpha	0.88	0.777	0.844	0.844	0.774	0.804	0.872	0.794
Rho	0.903	0.849	0.882	0.885	0.846	0.8600	0.899	0.858
Dimensionality	1	1	1	1	1	1.0000	1	1

The discriminant validity is usually estimated by Heterotrait-Monotrait Ratio (HTMT) (Henseler *et al.*, 2015). The Heterotrait-Monotrait ratios (HTMT) of correlations are shown in Table 3. All latent variables or components of two aspects of CSS-Urdu have HTMT ratios of 0.90. Henseler *et al.* (2015) believe that an HTMT value greater than 0.90 is considered a risk to discriminant validity. It is evident from Table 3 that Eight latent variables of CSS-Urdu have HTMT ratios below 0.90. it means that eight latent variables measured by 45 items have adequate power of discrimination among themselves.

SPPR ↔ SPMR	0.853
SPPR ↔ SPSR	0.755
SPPR ↔ SPLR	0.676
SPPR ↔ CPPR	0.505
SPPR ↔ CPMR	0.334
SPPR ↔ CPSR	0.37
SPPR ↔ CPLR	0.448
SPMR ↔ SPSR	0.863
SPMR ↔ SPLR	0.722
SPMR ↔ CPPR	0.546
SPMR ↔ CPMR	0.448
SPMR ↔ CPSR	0.493
SPMR ↔ CPLR	0.572
SPSR ↔ SPLR	0.785
SPSR ↔ CPPR	0.592
SPSR ↔ CPMR	0.487
SPSR ↔ CPSR	0.562
SPSR ↔ CPLR	0.578
SPLR ↔ CPPR	0.554
SPLR ↔ CPMR	0.527
SPLR ↔ CPSR	0.575
SPLR ↔ CPLR	0.663
CPPR ↔ CPMR	0.864
CPPR ↔ CPSR	0.831
CPPR ↔ CPLR	0.832
CPMR ↔ CPSR	0.871
CPMR ↔ CPLR	0.723
CPSR ↔ CPLR	0.898

### 7.3 Measurement Model

Tables 4 and 5 display the item loadings, standard errors (S.E.), confidence levels at 95%, and the significance of loadings. Table 4 shows different components or latent variables and their related items loading indices of students' self-perception or element of knowledge of the civic sense. It has

four dimensions. Twenty-three items were loaded on these four dimensions of students' self-perception of knowledge of civic sense component; SPPR o6 items, SPMR o4 items, SPSR o7 items, and SPLR o6 items. All items (Table 4) have significant loadings above 0.50. Hair Jr *et al.* (2021) say such loadings fall above the minimum acceptable and significant loadings criteria.

Component	Item	Estimate	S.E.	95 % CI		T-Statistics	P-Value
				LL	UL		
Self-Perception on Personal Responsibilities	SPPR2	0.713	0.03	0.624	0.743	23.23	0.00
	SPPR4	0.696	0.028	0.644	0.767	25.60	0.00
	SPPR7	0.774	0.03	0.654	0.765	23.60	0.00
	SPPR8	0.788	0.038	0.614	0.749	17.97	0.00
	SPPR9	0.711	0.019	0.732	0.805	40.36	0.00
	SPPR10	0.767	0.035	0.597	0.724	19.17	0.00
Self-Perception on Moral Responsibilities	SPMR1	0.798	0.023	0.747	0.845	34.56	0.00
	SPMR3	0.777	0.025	0.721	0.82	31.16	0.00
	SPMR7	0.737	0.039	0.559	0.714	16.48	0.00
	SPMR9	0.752	0.032	0.624	0.755	21.59	0.00
Self-Perception on Social Responsibilities	SPSR1	0.707	0.027	0.656	0.756	26.18	0.00
	SPSR2	0.74	0.022	0.701	0.779	33.63	0.00
	SPSR4	0.723	0.023	0.678	0.765	31.43	0.00
	SPSR5	0.696	0.026	0.637	0.741	26.76	0.00
	SPSR6	0.71	0.022	0.658	0.741	32.27	0.00
	SPSR9	0.723	0.024	0.668	0.763	30.12	0.00
	SPSR10	0.735	0.022	0.695	0.772	33.40	0.00
Self-Perception on Legal Responsibilities	SPLR3	0.755	0.021	0.708	0.793	35.95	0.00
	SPLR4	0.731	0.023	0.687	0.772	31.78	0.00
	SPLR7	0.743	0.022	0.695	0.788	33.77	0.00
	SPLR8	0.801	0.016	0.771	0.831	50.06	0.00
	SPLR9	0.716	0.025	0.659	0.765	28.64	0.00
	SPLR10	0.753	0.021	0.713	0.789	35.85	0.00



Likewise, Table 5 demonstrates that GSCA Pro software calculated items loadings, their standard error, confidence levels at 95%, and calculated T-statistic and significance for four dimensions of the second component of CSS-Urdu. Twenty-two items significantly loaded across four dimensions of civic practices of CSS-Urdu; CPPR 05 items, CPMR 05 items, CPSR 08 items, and CPLR 04 items. Thus, 45 items in hypothesised model loaded across 08 dimensions of CSS-Urdu. All item loadings of selected items in the final draft have item loadings above 0.50 and are also significant. According to the standards of Hair *et al.* (2014), the measurement model has significant item loadings.

Component	Item	Estimate	S.E.	95 % CI		T-Statistics	P-Value
				LL	UL		
Civic Practices on Personal Responsibilities	CPPR1	0.728	0.026	0.674	0.773	28.00	0.00
	CPPR2	0.765	0.018	0.725	0.795	42.50	0.00
	CPPR6	0.736	0.024	0.688	0.776	30.66	0.00
	CPPR8	0.668	0.025	0.612	0.715	26.72	0.00
	CPPR10	0.72	0.025	0.665	0.772	28.80	0.00
Civic Practices on Moral Responsibilities	CPMR1	0.746	0.018	0.704	0.78	41.44	0.00
	CPMR3	0.695	0.02	0.652	0.729	34.75	0.00
	CPMR6	0.694	0.022	0.641	0.737	31.54	0.00
	CPMR7	0.712	0.019	0.675	0.751	37.47	0.00
	CPMR8	0.726	0.017	0.695	0.759	42.70	0.00
Civic Practices on Social Responsibilities	CPSR2	0.739	0.02	0.692	0.776	36.95	0.00
	CPSR3	0.725	0.024	0.676	0.768	30.20	0.00
	CPSR4	0.692	0.023	0.653	0.734	30.08	0.00
	CPSR5	0.739	0.017	0.706	0.775	43.47	0.00
	CPSR6	0.701	0.023	0.648	0.736	30.47	0.00
	CPSR8	0.716	0.021	0.663	0.751	34.09	0.00
	CPSR9	0.751	0.022	0.707	0.788	34.13	0.00
	CPSR10	0.744	0.022	0.699	0.783	33.81	0.00
Civic Practices on Legal Responsibilities	CPLR1	0.702	0.03	0.645	0.755	23.40	0.00
	CPLR2	0.731	0.027	0.68	0.787	27.07	0.00
	CPLR3	0.808	0.014	0.777	0.834	57.71	0.00
	CPLR4	0.714	0.021	0.666	0.752	34.00	0.00

## 8. Discussion

The Civic Sense Scale (CSS) covered two aspects of students' civic sense: self-perception about civic sense and civic practices. Although it is difficult to measure an abstract variable, the confirmatory factor analysis in structure component analysis can assist in determining the suitability and success of measuring an abstract variable such as civic sense. Almost all countries worldwide have increased focus on civic education programs, from childhood to university education (Isac *et al.*, 2011). Due to this focus, students have become more aware of civic responsibilities and engaged in social, environmental, and national issues. (Nelson *et al.*, 2010). In this way, measuring and assessing students' civic sense is critical. The CSS-Urdu has the same underpinning theoretical structure and has incorporated the aspects in civic measurement instruments and suggestions of Chi *et al.* (2006), Hatcher (2011), Doolittle and Faul (2013), White (2012) and Veeh *et al.* (2019). The scale of CSS-Urdu can be used to explore civic sense. As this CSS-Urdu is prepared and validated locally, it can be used in Pakistan to assess Pakistani students' civic understanding at different education levels.

## 9. Implications

This scale can be a screening instrument to discover the students' civic sense and identify areas of civic behaviour and understanding needed to focus on students. On the results of this measure, suitable civic education courses are interventions that can be designed according to students' profile of civic sense.

## 10. Recommendations

CSS-Urdu can be used in other populations as well. It is used in federal secondary school students in Pakistan; therefore, it should be used and validated at Madaris, public schools, and private schools. The school profiles can be prepared based on the results of the execution of this scale. In this way, school authorities can improve their civic environment.

## References

- Abbasi, A. N. (2017). Civic sense - A missing thing. *The Nation*. Retrieved from <https://nation.com.pk/2017/11/27/civic-sense-a-missing-thing/>
- Banerjee, D., & Rai, M. (2020). Social isolation in Covid-19: The impact of loneliness. In (Vol. 66, pp. 525-527): SAGE Publications Sage UK: London, England.
- Barone, T. N. (2002). Civic Education and Citizenship in Malaysian Education.
- Belay, A., & Tefera, B. (2022). Validation of Adolescent Civic Engagement Scale in the Ethiopian Context. *Journal of Positive School Psychology*, 6(5), 8306-8320. doi:<https://journalppw.com/index.php/jpsp/article/download/9350/6078/10805>
- Bhardwaj, A. (2016). Importance of education in human life: A holistic approach. *International Journal of Science and Consciousness*, 2(2), 23-28.
- Chi, B., Jastrzab, J., & Melchior, A. (2006). Developing Indicators and Measures of Civic Outcomes for Elementary School Students. *Civic Engagement*, 41.
- Cho, G., & Choi, J. Y. (2020). An empirical comparison of generalised structured component analysis and partial least squares path modeling under variance-based structural equation models. *Behaviormetrika*, 47(1), 243-272. doi:10.1007/s41237-019-00098-0
- Claes, E., Hooghe, M., & Stolle, D. (2009). The political socialisation of adolescents in Canada: Differential effects of civic education on visible minorities. *Canadian Journal of Political Science/Revue canadienne de science politique*, 42(3), 613-636.
- Das, S. K. (2019). Confidence interval is more informative than p-value in research. *International*

- Journal of Engineering Applied Sciences and Technology*, 4(6), 278-282.
- Dewantara, J. A., Suhendar, I. F., Rosyid, R., & Atmaja, T. S. (2019). Pancasila as ideology and characteristics civic education in Indonesia. *International Journal for Educational and Vocational Studies*, 1(5), 400-405.
- Dharma, S., Sapriya, S., Winatapura, U. S., & Komalasari, K. (2018). *Civic Education and Student Responses to Global Issue*. Paper presented at the Annual Civic Education Conference (ACEC 2018).
- Doolittle, A., & Faul, A. C. (2013). Civic Engagement Scale: A Validation Study. *SAGE Open*, 3(3), 2158244013495542. doi:10.1177/2158244013495542
- Dudley, R. L., & Gitelson, A. R. (2003). Civic Education, Civic Engagement, and Youth Civic Development. *PS: Political Science and Politics*, 36(2), 263-267.
- Epstein, S. E. (2017). Supporting global awareness: A proposal for youth civic engagement. *Schools*, 14(1), 141-154.
- Gopinathan, S. (2012). Are we all global citizens now? Reflections on citizenship and citizenship education in a globalising world (with special reference to Singapore).
- Habibyar, M. T. (2009). Civics and Citizenship Education in Schools in Afghanistan.
- Hair, J. F., Hult, G. T. M., Ringle, C., & Sarstedt, M. (2014). *A Primer on Partial Least Squares Structural Equation Modeling (PLS-SEM)*.
- Hair Jr, J. F., Hult, G. T. M., Ringle, C. M., & Sarstedt, M. (2021). *A primer on partial least squares structural equation modeling (PLS-SEM)*: Sage publications.
- Hatcher, J. A. (2011). *Assessing Civic Knowledge and Engagement*. Wiley, 81-92. doi: DOI: 10.1002/IR.382
- Henderson, L. J. (2003). The Civic Index: Theory, Practice and Learning across American Cities. *Administrative Theory & Praxis*, 25(3), 371-392.
- Henseler, J., Ringle, C. M., & Sarstedt, M. (2015). A new criterion for assessing discriminant validity in variance-based structural equation modeling. *Journal of the academy of marketing science*, 43(1), 115-135.
- Hwang, H. (2009). Regularised generalised structured component analysis. *Psychometrika*, 74(3), 517-530. doi:10.1007/S11336-009-9119-Y
- Hwang, H., & Takane, Y. (2014). *Generalised structured component analysis: A component-based approach to structural equation modeling* (1st Edition ed.): CRC Press.
- Hwang, H., Takane, Y., & Jung, K. (2017). Generalised structured component analysis with uniqueness terms for accommodating measurement error. *Frontiers in psychology*, 8, 2137. doi:10.3389/fpsyg.2017.02137
- Isac, M. M., Maslowski, R., & Van der Werf, G. (2011). Effective civic education: an educational effectiveness model for explaininstudents' civic knowledge. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 22(3), 313-333.
- Ismail, M. M., Othman, Z., Hassan, N. A., Abdullah, N. H., Abdullah, A., & Zan, U. M. S. M. (2019). Nation-building among youths in Malaysia: The Civic education approach. *Journal of Nusantara Studies (JONUS)*, 4(2), 390-409.
- Keith, M., John, D., & Elizabeth, G. (2013). The Rediscovery of Education's Civic Purpose Preparing Students for Democratic Life. *The Journal of General Education*, 62(4), 258-276. doi:10.5325/jgeneeduc.62.4.0258
- Lenzi, M., Vieno, A., Sharkey, J., Mayworm, A., Scacchi, L., Pastore, M., & Santinello, M. (2014). How school can teach civic engagement besides civic education: The role of democratic school climate. *American journal of community psychology*, 54(3), 251-261.
- Lin, A. R. (2014). Examining students' perception of classroom openness as a predictor of civic

- knowledge: A cross-national analysis of 38 countries. *Applied Developmental Science*, 18(1), 17-30.
- Lukman, A. A., & Audu, H. (2014). Promoting sustainable development in Nigeria: Via civic education. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 5(34), 119-125.
- Marsone, S. (2016). *INTEGRATION OF CIVIC EDUCATION INTO LOWER-SECONDARY SCHOOL CURRICULUM*. Paper presented at the SOCIETY. INTEGRATION. EDUCATION. Proceedings of the International Scientific Conference.
- Mihai, A. (2014). Finding the right mix? Teaching European studies through blended learning. In *Teaching and Learning the European Union* (pp. 217-228): Springer.
- Muleya, G. (2019). Curriculum policy and practice of civic education in Zambia: A reflective perspective. *Journal: The Palgrave Handbook of Citizenship and Education*, 1-11.
- Nelson, J., Wade, P., & Kerr, D. (2010). Younpeople's civic attitudes and practicesEngland's outcomes from the IEA international civic and citizenship education study (ICCS) RRo6o.
- Veeh, C. A., Plassmeyer, M., Nicotera, N., & Brewer, S. E. (2019). A Combined Measure of Civic Engagement for Use Among Emerging Adults. *Journal of the Society for Social Work and Research*, 10(1), 13-34. doi:10.1086/701948
- Villegas-Reimers, E. (1994). *Civic Education in the School Systems of Latin America and the Caribbean*. Washington, DC: Academy for Educational Development: Bureau for Latin America and the Caribbean. U.S. Agency for International Development.
- Wahlström, N. (2022). School and democratic hope: The school as a space for civic literacy. *European Educational Research Journal*, 21(6), 994-1008. doi:10.1177/14749041221086721
- White, E. S. (2012). *Civic Engagement in the Upper Elementary Grades: An Examination of Parent and Teacher Practices and Children's Civic Identity*. (Doctor of Philosophy in Education), University of California, Los Angeles. Retrieved from [https://escholarship.org/content/qt1wr2r31p/qt1wr2r31p\\_noSplash\\_a582eb468f6b4b59aobf895628a94329.pdf](https://escholarship.org/content/qt1wr2r31p/qt1wr2r31p_noSplash_a582eb468f6b4b59aobf895628a94329.pdf)
- Yusuf, H. T., Odutayo, A. O., & Akintola, M. A. (2021). Civic Knowledge, Skills and Values as Correlates of Undergraduates Civic Engagement in Kwara State. *International Journal Pedagogy of Social Studies*, 5(2), 1-8.
- Zaff, J. F., Malanchuk, O., & Eccles, J. S. (2008). Predicting positive citizenship from adolescence to young adulthood: The effects of a civic context. *Applied Development Science*, 12(1), 38-53.